

# Evaluation Criteria for Rubric Creation Assignment

<b>Performance Dimensions</b>	<b>Evaluation Criteria</b>	<b>Comments</b>
<b>Selection of Performance Dimensions &amp; Criteria</b>	Performance dimensions and evaluation criteria strengthen the <b>substance</b> of students' work by focusing their attention on the <b>“what” (content), “why” (thinking), and “how” (process &amp; presentation) of students' performance</b>	
<b>Consistency &amp; Organization of Of Evaluation Criteria Across Levels</b>	The evaluation criteria across levels of a given dimension: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o include the <b>same elements</b> in each level,</li> <li>o are consistently presented in the <b>same order, progress incrementally</b> to scaffold students' performance,</li> <li>o strengthen students' ability to <b>distinguish the specific changes needed to shift the quality of their performance</b> from one level to the next</li> </ul>	
<b>Clarity of Task</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Concise phrasing</b> is quickly and easily absorbed—clarifying the task and making it feel doable</li> <li>• <b>Clear, descriptive, well-defined terms</b> help students to <b>identify what must be added (or subtracted) at each level of performance</b> in order to progress to the next level</li> <li>• Evaluation criteria are <b>linked to their effect on the audience and/or students' thinking and performance</b> at each level</li> </ul>	
<b>Formatting</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Row and column titles clearly identify</b> dimensions of performance and evaluation criteria, facilitating performance, assessment, and interpretation</li> <li>• An <b>even number of performance levels</b> forces a thoughtful choice about the quality of student performance</li> <li>• <b>Consistent wording and parallel presentation across levels</b> facilitate grading and make it easy to distinguish differences in each level of performance</li> <li>• <b>Adequate spacing and selective highlighting</b> makes it easy for students to see what to do at a glance, and facilitate grading</li> <li>• <b>Space for comments</b> facilitates personalized feedback</li> <li>• <b>Clear point system</b> helps students prioritize their work</li> </ul>	

**Additional Comments:**

# Evaluation Criteria for Rubric Creation Assignment

Performance Criteria	Student	Student Teacher	Experienced Teacher	Master (Expert) Teacher
<b>Selection of Performance Dimensions &amp; Criteria</b>	Does not affect <b>student work</b> or focus students' attention because an <b>inadequate number of performance dimensions</b> and/or <b>evaluation criteria</b> are included	Strengthens the <b>appearance</b> of students' work by focusing their attention on the <b>surface features of presentation</b> , but does not address content or students' thinking	Strengthens the <b>quality</b> of students' work by focusing their attention on <b>general features of content (and presentation)</b> , but does not address process or students' thinking	Strengthens the <b>substance</b> of students' work by focusing their attention on <b>specific features of content, thinking, process, and presentation</b> of the product
<b>Consistency &amp; Organization Of Evaluation Criteria Across Levels</b>	Usefulness of rubric as tool for feedback and evaluation is diminished by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evaluation criteria <b>DO NOT progress incrementally</b></li> <li>• <b>Inconsistent wording</b></li> <li>• <b>Presentation not parallel</b></li> <li>• <b>Different elements</b></li> <li>• <b>Different order</b> across levels</li> <li>• Identifies <b>elements unrelated to students' performance of targeted objectives</b></li> </ul>	Differences in students' performance are difficult to distinguish and grade because: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evaluation criteria <b>progress incrementally</b>, but <b>unevenly</b></li> <li>• <b>Inconsistent wording</b></li> <li>• <b>Presentation not parallel</b></li> <li>• <b>Same elements</b></li> <li>• <b>Same order</b> across levels</li> <li>• Identifies <b>general elements (+ or -)</b>, but <b>not specific enough</b> to shift performance to the next level</li> </ul>	Differences in students' performance difficult to distinguish and grade because: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evaluation criteria <b>progress incrementally</b></li> <li>• <b>Inconsistent wording</b></li> <li>• <b>Parallel presentation</b></li> <li>• <b>Same elements</b></li> <li>• <b>Same order</b> across levels</li> <li>• Identifies <b>missing elements that inhibit progress</b> to next level</li> </ul>	Differences in students' performance easy to distinguish and grade because: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evaluation criteria <b>progress incrementally, scaffolding student performance</b></li> <li>• <b>Consistent wording</b></li> <li>• <b>Parallel presentation</b></li> <li>• <b>Same elements</b></li> <li>• <b>Same order</b> across levels</li> <li>• Identifies <b>specific, concrete elements that will shift students' performance</b> to next level</li> </ul>
<b>Clarity of Task</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Lack of details and clear terms</b> impedes students' understanding of the task</li> <li>• <b>Too many or too few words</b> makes it hard for students to understand task</li> <li>• Evaluation criteria <b>unrelated to task</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clear terms, but <b>details needed</b> to improve students' understanding of the task</li> <li>• <b>Wordy phrasing</b> makes it hard for students to understand task</li> <li>• Evaluation criteria are <b>present, but vague</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Detailed descriptions, but <b>unclear terms</b> impeded students' understanding of the task</li> <li>• <b>Redundancy</b> diminishes ease of use</li> <li>• Evaluation criteria <b>specific, but not linked to audience or performance</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Clear terms and detailed descriptions</b> improve students' understanding of the task</li> <li>• <b>Concise phrasing</b> improves ease of use</li> <li>• Evaluation <b>criteria clearly linked to effect on audience &amp; performance</b></li> </ul>

# Evaluation Criteria for Rubric Creation Assignment

<p><b>Formatting</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Lack of row or column titles</b> make it difficult to determine requirements of the task</li> <li>• <b>Too many performance levels</b> makes it hard to see clear differences in students' performance from level to level</li> <li>• <b>Crowded layout and absence of formatting</b> increases the difficulty level of the task (and grading)</li> <li>• <b>No space for comments</b> limits feedback to elements on rubric</li> <li>• <b>No point system identified</b>—leaves students guessing about how grades will be determined</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Missing row or column titles</b> leave room for misunderstanding</li> <li>• <b>Insufficient number of performance levels (3 or less)</b> diminishes value of rubric as a tool for shifting students' performance from level to level</li> <li>• <b>Inadequate spacing between criteria and insufficient formatting</b> makes key information difficult to find quickly</li> <li>• <b>Inadequate space for comments</b> constrains personalized feedback</li> <li>• <b>Confusing point system</b> focuses students' attention on grading procedures instead of their work</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Row &amp; column titles</b> make it easy to identify key elements of the task</li> <li>• <b>Odd number of performance levels (at least 5)</b> reduces utility of rubric for distinguishing between levels of performance (most students will fall in the middle)</li> <li>• Although <b>key information is not highlighted, formatting facilitates</b> absorption of important information and <b>does not impede grading</b></li> <li>• <b>Placement &amp; formatting of comment space is inconvenient</b> for teacher/students</li> <li>• <b>Generic point system</b> focuses students' attention on their work, but leaves some ?s about grading</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Clear row &amp; column titles</b> identify performance dimensions and evaluation criteria—facilitating performance, assessment, and interpretation</li> <li>• <b>Even number of performance levels (at least 4)</b> forces a thoughtful choice about the quality of student performance</li> <li>• <b>Adequate spacing and selective highlighting</b> makes it easy for students to see what to do at a glance, and facilitate grading</li> <li>• <b>Substantive, usable space for comments</b> encourages personalized feedback</li> <li>• <b>Specific point system</b> focuses students' attention on content &amp; quality of work, helping them to prioritize</li> </ul>
--------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------